

International Scientific Organization http://iscientific.org/ Chemistry International www.bosaljournals.com/chemint/



Determination of preferred conformations of benzenetricarboxylic acids by means of genetic algorithm MNC for multi-modal search

R. Tijar^{1*}, M. Bourjila¹, A. EL Guerdaoui¹, B. El Merbouh¹, R. Drissi El Bouzaidi^{1,2} and A. El Gridani¹

¹Laboratoire de chimie physique, Faculté des Sciences, UniversitéIbnZohr, 80000, Agadir, Morocco ²Centre Régional des Métiers de L'Education et de la Formation (CRMEF), Souss Massa Daraa, Inezgane, Morocco *Corresponding author's E. mail: tijar-rachida-87@hotmail.fr

ARTICLE INFO

Article type: Research article Article history: Received August 2017 Accepted October 2017 October 2017 Issue Keywords: Genetic algorithm MNC Hemimellitic acid Trimelitic acid Benzene tricarboxylic PES Ortho-position Multi-modal

ABSTRACT

The structures of benzenetricarboxylic acids: hemimellitic, trimellitic and trimesic have been investigated using genetic algorithm MNC. Calculated structures and heats of formation, using semi-empiric method AM1, are reported for all the lower-energy conformers of each species. In effect, hemimellitic acid and trimellitic in which the carboxyl groups are linked to the benzene ring in adjacent (ortho) positions assume a non-planar geometry, while trimesic acid which having no carboxylic groups in the *ortho*-position adopted a planar structure in the two most stable conformations.

© 2017 International Scientific Organization: All rights reserved.

Capsule Summary: The geometry and energy of benzenetricarboxylic acids were studied by means of genetic algorithm based on the Multi-Niche Crowding method and coupled to the semi-empirical method AM1. The hemimellitic acid and trimellitic in which the carboxyl groups are linked to the benzene ring in adjacent (ortho) positions assume a non-planar geometry, whereas trimesic acid showed a planar structure in the two most stable conformations which was due lack of carboxylic groups at the *ortho*-position.

Cite This Article As: R. Tijar, M. Bourjila, A. EL Guerdaoui, B. El Merbouh, R. Drissi El Bouzaidi and A. El Gridani. Determination of preferred conformations of benzene tricarboxylic acids by means of genetic algorithm MNC for multi-modal search. Chemistry International 3(4) (2017) 477-486.

INTRODUCTION

The benzene polycarboxylic acids represent a family of organic compounds of great importance, because of their abundance in nature and their vital role in organic synthesis. Along with their various ester derivatives are used as intermediates in the preparations of plasticizers, resins, alkaloidal solutions, dyes, inks, adhesives, pharmaceutical (antifungal) aids and in the preservation of foods, fats, and fruit juices (Alexander et al., 2006; Opgrande et al., 1992; Read and Purves, 1952).

These acids are also of interest in the environmental chemistry of natural waters due to the formation of toxic metal-benzene polycarboxylic ligands. However, as they are formed by the drastic oxidation of graphite, coals, wood lignin and similar materials, they have geochemical and ecological significance (Giammar and Dzombak, 1998).

Tijar et al / Chemistry International 3(4) (2017) 477-486



Fig. 1: Structural formulae and dihedre angles of hemimellitic acid, trimellitic acid, and trimesic acid

In this paper we became interested to study theoretically the geometry of isomeric benzenetricarboxylic acids: hemimellitic acid, trimellitic acid and trimesic acid (structural formulae are shown in Figure 1) which are chemically known as 1,2,3-benzenetricarboxylic; 1,2,4benzenetricarboxylic and 1,3,5-benzenetricarboxylic respectively. Several conformations of these molecular systems can be obtained by rotating the carboxyl groups and the hydroxyl groups around the C-C and O-C bonds, respectively. We are considering examining the most 10 stable conformations located on the potential energy surface of each species and discuss the influence of position of carboxylic groups on their structural rearrangements.

The aim of this work was to locate the global and local minima on the potential energy surface for hemimellitic, trimellitic and trimesic acids by using genetic algorithm MNC coupled to the semi-empirical method AM1 (GA-MNC/AM1). This technique, originally created and developed in our own laboratories (El Merbouh et al., 2014), has proven in the past to be quite productive in structural studies of a wide variety of organic compounds of low volatility including aminoacids (Bourjila et al., 2016; 2017; EL Guerdaoui et al., 2016) and carboxylic acids (Tijar et al., 2016).

Computational procedure

For exploring and exploiting the potential energy surface of an isolated molecular system, we are considering using the stochastic techniques that based on the simulation of a biological system, such as genetic algorithms (Holland, 1975). These are based on the mechanisms of natural selection and genetic recombination. They work on a population point candidates, called chromosomes or individuals, in order to optimize an objective function or fitness. Each chromosome is composed of a set of elements called characteristics or genes. In the study of the conformational space problem of a given molecule, individuals correspond to conformations, the genes to dihedral angles and the fitness function to the heat of formation of the system.

The location of local minima in addition to the global minimum can be of great interest. To do this, we used the method known as Multi Niche Crowding (MNC) (Cedeño and al., 1994; Cedeño, 1995) that using the filler concept (Crowding) not only during the insertion of children in the population, but also when selecting individuals who will breed 'Crowding selection'. For each individual Ii of the population, a 'partner' Ij is selected from a group of individuals of size Cs (Crowding size selection) taken randomly from the population

The partner thus chosen should be as similar to Ii. During the replacement, the algorithm uses a technique called Worst Among Most Similar (WAMS) (Cedeño and Vemuri, 1999). It is first to choose randomly Cf groups of each individuals s. These groups are called 'Crowding Factor groups'. Subsequently an individual of each group is identified so that it is most similar to the child. Among these individuals Cf candidates for replacement, whichever is the less suitable is replaced by the child. The assessment criterion is the calculated heat of formation for the conformation generated by the AM1 method both during



Fig. 2: Schematic illustration of worst among most similar

construction of the initial population and after application of crossover operators and possibly mutation. Once the algorithm converges after the maximum number of generation sets (500 generation), unconstrained optimization allows releasing the structure so that individuals of the same niche converge towards the corresponding minimum.

The genetic algorithm based on the MNC technique is implemented in a package of program interfaced with MOPAC in order to evaluate the quality of the individual to insert into the population in each iteration (El Merbouh et al., 2014). The criteria of evaluation are the energy of the molecule (the heat of formation in our case). The semiempirical method AM1 is used to accomplish this task. The data file has been conceived so that a constraint is imposed to the values of the dihedral angles defining the degrees of freedom of the conformation generated beforehand randomly. This constraint permits indeed to calculate exactly the energy of the conformation generated during the construction of the initial population and after the application of crossover and eventually the mutation operators as well. Once the algorithm converges after the fixed maximum number of generation, an optimization without constraint is performed in order to release the

Table 1: Control	parameters	of the MI	NC genetic
1 11			

aigoritinn	
Population size	500
Crowding selection size (Cs)	25
Crowding Factor size (C _f)	3
Crowding size (s)	25
Interval crossover parameter (ε)	10
Crossover Probability (Pc)	1.0
Mutation probability (Pm)	0.06

structure so that the individuals of the same niche converge to the corresponding minimum.

It has been discussed elsewhere that real encoding is ideally suited to handle problems in a continuous search space (Deb, 2001). The encoding scheme is so that the genome of each individual (conformation) is composed of n dihedral angels (φ 1, φ 2,..., φ n), in the case of a molecule of n degrees of freedom, whose values represent a location on the PES. The crossover operator used is called interval crossover (Cedeño, et al., 1994). In interval crossover, only one offspring is generated. For each pair of parent genes φ 1 and φ 2, the offspring's gene is selected at random from the interval $[\phi_1-\epsilon/2, \phi_2+\epsilon/2]$ assuming without loss of generality that $\varphi 1 < \varphi 2$, if we use a real encoding as in our case. The parameter ε will be called in the following the parameter of interval crossover. The crossover operation is thus performed so that it generates an offspring close to the parents. The mutation is applied to the offspring, generated by the crossover operation, with a probability Pm, while permuting a couple of genes of the offspring selected at random. Table 1 regroups the different control parameters of the algorithm used in this study.

RESULTATS AND DISCUSSION

Conformational analysis of neutral hemimellitic acid

The calculations carried out using the genetic algorithm MNC coupled to the AM1 method on the neutral hemimellitic acid have revealed the existence of several possibles conformations.

Figure 3 shows the 10 lowest energy structures localised and caracterized as minima on the PES of neutral hemimellitic acid. Table 2 summarize the heats of formation and diheder angles calculated by means of AM1 method, also shown in the energy difference of the different conformers as compared with the most stable one.



Fig. 3: The 10 lowest energy structures located on the PES of neutral hemimellitic acid by GA-MNC/AM1





Fig. 3: Continue...

Regarding hemimellitic acid, the calculations showed that rotation around the C–C bond is not favorable in this isomer. Rotation around the C–C bond is sterically hindered by the neighboring carboxyl groups. The steric repulsion between three carboxyl groups gives rise to a high rotation barrier. By inspecting the geometries of the all stable conformers of hemimellitic acid, it can be concluded that none is planar.

As seen from table 2, the conformers denoted Hem-Hem-n2 and Hem-n3 have less energy values, making n1, them energetically more favorable and hence structurally more stables. Indeed, their heats of formation are respectively -234.9, -234.8 and -234.7 kcal/mol. Indeed, these conformations have practically equal energies where their ΔH_f are -234.9, -234.8 et -234.7 Kcal/mol, respectively. In these three stables conformations, AM1 Calculations show that the carboxyl group bonded to C₂ lies perpendicular to the benzene ring (the corresponding dihedral angle is close to 90°) whereas the two other carboxyl groups C₁-COOH and C₃-COOH lie in the plane of the benzene ring. This can be explained by the fact that the three close-lying voluminous carboxyl groups cannot all be positioned in the same plane. Thus, at least one of them has to assume an off-planar orientation. In order to have an as-large-as-possible resonance stabilization, the non-planarity is not equally shared among the three carboxyl groups, but two of them (at the extremities) remain in plane, thus maximizing their resonance effect, whereas one (the middle one) is then bent 90º (thus minimizing steric repulsion). In addition, the rotation of this group around the corresponding C-C bond is sterically hindered.

The other conformers Hem-ni/ i = 4,5,.....,10 are corresponding to the local minima on the PES of neutral hemimellitic acid. Their heats of formation are varied from -231.9 kcal/mol to -230.9 kcal/mol and they are less stable from 3 to 4 kcal/mol compared to the reference structure Hem-n1. AM1 calculations show that the three carboxyl groups are lie out of the plane of the benzene ring, where a hydrogen bond is established between the proton of transCOOH group and the oxygen atom of the group adjacent. In fact, this bond is formed between the proton of C₃-COOH group and the oxygen atom of C₂-COOH group in Hem-n4, Hem-n5, Hem-n6 and Hem-n7, while it is formed between the proton of C₂-COOH group and the oxygen atom of C₁-COOH group in the conformations Hem-n8, Hem-n9 and Hem-n10. The results obtained through Zoran et al. (Zoran et al, 2004) show that neutral hemimellitic acid has four distinct stable structures named 4a, 4b, 4c et 4d, where the C₂-COOH group is perpendicular to the benzene plane, whereas the two other carboxyl groups are in the same plane of the benzene ring. These structures have similar values of energy, varying in the narrow interval between -982.8 KJ/mol and -983.5 kJ/mol. Indeed, the structures 4a, 4b and 4d correspond successively to the structures Hem-n1, Hem-n2 and Hem-n3 obtained by GA-MNC/AM1.

Conformational analysis of neutral trimellitic acid

The conformational analysis of neutral trimellitic acid shows the presence of several minima on its PES of which the 10 structures considering the most stable are grouped in Figure 4. The corresponding heats of formation as well as the relative energies and the dihedral angles optimized using the AM1 method is recorded (Table 3).

The results of calculations obtained by the GA-MNC/AM1 method, reveals that trimellitic acid has nonplanar structures. Generally, the both ortho carboxyl groups C_1 -COOH and C_2 -COOH are out the plane of the benzene ring, whereas the other carboxyl group C₄-COOH lie in the plane of the benzene ring.

From the results indicated in the Table 3, it is deduced that the most stable structures for neutral trimellitic acid are Trim-n1, Trim-n2, Trim-n3, Trim-n4, Trim-n5, Trim-n6, Trim-n7 and Trim-n8. These structures are energetically close, where their heats of formation are -238.7, -238.6, -238.5, -238.4, -238.4, -238.4, -238.3 and -238.2 kcal/mol, respectively.









Trim-n10

Fig. 4: Continue....

This allows us to say that one of these conformations can be the global minimum on the PES of the neutral trimellitic acid.

Referring to the geometrical parameters, we see that in the conformations Trim-n1, Trim-n2, Trim-n3 and Trimn4, the two carbonyls of C₁-COOH and C₂-COOH lie in the same sides of the plane of the benzene ring. In fact, this carbonyls are below the benzene ring by about -121° and -162°, respectively, in the conformations Trim-n1 and Trimn2, while they are above the benzene ring by about 37.4° and 37°, respectively, in the conformations Trim-n3 and Trim-n4 (Table 3). We also noted that the difference between Trim-n1 and Trim-n2 and between Trim-n3 and Trim-n4 is located only in the position of the C₄-COOH group.

Concerning the conformations Trim-n5 and Trimn6, the two C=O groups of C_1 -COOH and C_2 -COOH lie on opposite sides of the plane of the benzene ring, where their angles of deviation are -136.24° and 28.10°, respectively, in the conformation Trim-n5 and -138.11° and 30.55°, respectively, in the conformation Trim-n6. For the conformations Trim-n7 et Trim-n8, our calculations show that the carboxylic group C₁-COOH is almost perpendicular to the plane of the benzene ring, whereas the carboxyl group C₂-COOH is in the same plane as the benzene ring. Otherwise, AM1 calculations show that the two conformations Trim-n9 and Trim-n10 have the same energy -235.9 kcal/mol, and they are less stable by 2.8 kcal/mol compared to reference structure Trim-n1. These two structures differ only in the position of the carboxyl group C₅-COOH, and they are characterized by the presence of an intramolecular hydrogen bond (about 2.09 Å) which occurs between the proton of C_1 -COOH and the carbonyl of C₂-COOH.

Conformational analysis of neutral trimesic acid

Table 4 summarize the structural and energetic parameters calculated for the 10 lowest energy minima located on the potential energy surfaces of the neutral trimesic acid by GA-MNC/AM1.The geometries corresponding to these minima are given in Figure 5.

In the AM1 calculation, the first two minima called Tris-n1 and Tris-n2 are the lowest energy structures located on the PES of the neutral trimesic acid, so one of them can probably be the global minimum. Indeed, the energy difference between Tris-n1 and Tris-n2 is slightly lower (0.1 kcal/mol), where their heats of formation are -244.7 kcal/mol and -244.6 kcal/mol, respectively. The others conformations Tris-n3,4,.....10 represent local minima and they are less stable from 6 kcal/mol to 13.1 kcal/mol relative to the reference structure Tris-n1.

At the structural level, we note that the conformers Tris-n1 and Tris-n2 are the only planar structures detectable on the PES of the neutral trimesic acid. This implies that the steric hindrance is of little importance and that planarity is caused by the tendency to maximize the resonance effect.

Regarding conformers Tris-n3, Tris-n4, Tris-n5 and Tris-n6, our calculations showed that they have similar values of energy, varying in the narrow interval between -238.7 and -238.4 kcal/mol. Their geometry are non-plane, where the two carboxyl groups C_3 -COOH and C_5 -COOH remain in plane (thus maximizing their resonance effect) whereas the carboxyl group C₁-COOH which adopts a trans form assumes an off-planar orientation. The less stability of these conformers may be explained by van der Waals interaction between hydrogen of the C1-COOH group and hydrogen of phenyl ring in the ortho position. Otherwise, the conformers Tris-n7, Tris-n8, Tris-n9 and Tris-n10 differ insignificantly in energy (by only 1.2 kcal/mol), and they are more unstable than Tris-n1 in the range of 11.9-13.1 kcal/mol. Structurally, these conformations are also adopted a non-planar structure, where the carboxyl group C₃-COOH is coplanar with the phenyl ring, while both carboxyl groups C₁-COOH and C₅-COOH wich have adopted a trans forms lie out of the plane of the benzene ring. In fact, the less stability of these conformations can be explained by van der Waals interaction between hydrogen of the C₁-COOH and C₅-COOH groups and hydrogen atoms of phenyl ring in the ortho positions.



Fig. 5: The 10 lowest energy structures located on the PES of neutral trimesic acid by GA-MNC/AM1

Tijar et al / Chemistry International 3(4) (2017) 477-486



Fig. 5: continue...

Table 2: Heats of formarion ΔH_f (in kcal/mol), relative energie $\Delta(\Delta H_f)$ (in kcal/mol) and dihedral angles (in degree) of the 10 lowest energy minima obtained for hemimellitic acid by GA-MNC/AM1

	ΔH_f	$\Delta(\Delta H_f)$	$0 = C_7 C_1 C_2$	H-0C70	$0 = C_8 C_2 C_1$	H-0C80	$0 = C_9 C_3 C_4$	H-0C90
Hem-n1	-234.9	0.0	-1.95	-0.05	96.35	-3.37	-7.98	-3.10
Hem-n2	-234.8	0.1	4.68	-0.44	89.11	0.08	174.54	0.45
Hem-n3	-234.7	0.2	179.70	0.84	94.18	-0.25	-6.59	-2.49
Hem-n4	-231.9	3	-17.3	1.00	117.20	-7.50	49.50	177.39
Hem-n5	-231.6	3.3	162.44	-2.13	117.76	-4.09	50.37	177.19
Hem-n6	-231.4	3.5	18.19	-1.30	75.86	-4.49	-49.74	178.88
Hem-n7	-231.4	3.5	-160.01	4.50	68.56	-1.48	-53.39	179.51
Hem-n8	-231.4	3.5	37.61	-2.18	114.78	-170.73	-28.68	-6.54
Hem-n9	-231.3	3.6	-145.12	5.79	106.02	173.94	-26.97	-4.80
Hem-n10	-230.9	4	-148.42	-2.95	104.49	173.87	147.84	-2.82

Table 3: Heats of formarion Δ Hf (in kcal/mol), relative energie $\Delta(\Delta$ H_f) (in kcal/mol) and dihedral angles (in degree) of the 10 lowest energy minima obtained for trimellitic acid by GA-MNC/AM1

	ΔH_f	$\Delta(\Delta H_f)$	$0 = C_7 C_1 C_2$	H-0C70	$O=C_8C_2C_3$	H-0C80	$0 = C_9 C_4 C_3$	H-OC ₉ O
Trim-n1	-238.7	0.0	-121.56	7.8	-162.11	-1.0	-178.62	0.1
Trim-n2	-238.6	0.1	-121.35	8.1	-162.61	-0.7	0.88	0.0
Trim-n3	-238.5	0.2	37.41	-2.3	36.97	6.6	-178.52	0.4
Trim-n4	-238.4	0.3	37.31	-2.4	37.60	6.4	2.35	-0.14
Trim-n5	-238.4	0.3	-136.24	4.9	28.10	3.8	-178.48	0.3
Trim-n6	-238.4	0.3	-138.11	4.9	30.55	3.5	1.98	0.0
Trim-n7	-238.3	0.4	86.49	-6.4	-170.53	-0.6	-179.36	0.3
Trim-n8	-238.2	0.5	94.47	-7.17	-174.85	-0.4	0.40	-0.1
Trim-n9	-235.9	2.8	123.48	-171.6	-143.51	-1.6	-179.34	-0.2
Trim-n10	-235.9	2.8	123.74	-172.0	-143.05	-1.3	1.61	-0.3

Table 4: Heats of formarion Δ Hf (in kcal/mol), relative energies $\Delta(\Delta H_f)$ (in kcal/mol) and dihedral angles (in degree) of the 10 lowest energy minima obtained for trimesic acid by GA-MNC/AM1

of the To towest energy minima obtained for trimesic actu by GA-MinC/AMT								
	ΔH_{f}	$\Delta(\Delta H_f)$	$0 = C_7 C_1 C_2$	H-OC7O	$O = C_8 C_3 C_4$	H-OC ₈ O	$O = C_9 C_5 C_4$	H-OC ₉ O
Tris-n1	-244.7	0.0	179.14	0.04	179.34	0.01	0.90	0.01
Tris-n2	-244.6	0.1	-179.94	-0.05	-0.08	0.02	179.97	-0.04
Tris-n3	-238.7	6	29.44	-175.54	0.68	0.43	178.14	0.23
Tris-n4	-238.6	6.1	30.35	-175.06	-178.08	-0.28	178.66	0.28
Tris-n5	-238.5	6.2	30.25	-174.48	0.67	0.44	-1.09	-0.54
Tris-n6	-238.4	6.3	31.41	-174.69	-178.30	-0.26	-1.08	-0.57
Tris-n7	-232.8	11.9	-34.01	174.76	-3.92	-0.23	-149.25	-175.40
Tris-n8	-232.5	12.2	148.07	174.91	3.51	0.22	32.62	-174.15
Tris-n9	-232.4	12.3	-145.81	-174.60	-3.79	-0.24	-147.09	-175.17
Tris-n10	-231.6	13.1	-37.56	174.16	-3.33	-0.18	-36.77	173.19

CONCLUSIONS

The main conclusion of this research is that the presence of two carboxyl groups ortho to one another is sufficient to make the molecule non-planar in all of its structures. This is appears clearly in the case of the hemimellitic acid and trimellitic acid. Whereas, trimesic acid that has no carboxylic groups in the ortho-position (carboxyl groups are mutually in meta positions), and thus sufficiently removed from each other, are planar in their most stable conformations.

REFERENCES

- Alexander A., Emanuel M., Nazmia A. B., 2006. The solubilities of benzene polycarboxylic acids in water. J. Chem. Thermodynamics 38, 565–571.
- Bourjila, M., El Merbouh, B., Tijar, R., EL Guerdaoui, A., Drissi El Bouzaidi, R., El Gridani, A., EL Mouhtadi, M., 2016. Ployalanine gas phase acidities determination and conformational space analysis by genetic algorithm assessment, J. Chemistry International 2(3), 145-157.
- Bourjila, M., Tijar, R., El Merbouh, B., EL Guerdaoui, A., Drissi El Bouzaidi, R., El Gridani, A., EL Mouhtadi, M., 2017. Conformational Properties of N-Formyl-L-Cys-NH2 in Its γ_D -Backbone Conformations as Computed by Semi-Empirical and Ab Initio Methods, Journal of Chemical and Pharmaceutical Research 9(2), 176-180.
- Cedeño, W., 1995. The multi-niche crowding genetic algorithm: Analysis and application. Ph.D. Thesis, University of California Davis.
- Cedeño, W., Vemuri, V. R., 1999. Analysis of speciation and 1 niching in the multi-niche crowding GA. Theoretical 2 Computer Science 229, 177–197.
- Cedeño, W., Vemuri, V. R., Slezak, T., 1994. Multi-niche crowding in genetic algorithms and its application to the assembly of DNA restriction fragments. Journal of Evolutionary computation 2, 321–345.
- Deb. K., 2001. Multi-objective optimization using evolutionary algorithms (1stedition)., Wiley, J., Sons, Ltd, Chichester. New York.
- EL Guerdaoui, A., ElMerbouh, B., Tijar, R., Bourjila, M., Drissi El Bouzaidi, R., El Gridani, A., EL Mouhtadi, M., 2016. An exhaustive conformational analysis of N-formyl-Ltyrosinamide using a genetic algorithm for multimodal search, Comptes Rendus Chimie 20, 1-8.
- EL Guerdaoui, A., Tijar, R., El Merbouh, B., Bourjila, M., Drissi El Bouzaidi, R., ElGridani, A., EL Mouhtadi, M., 2016. Conformational analysis of diamide system HCO-L-Phenylalanine-NH2 by genetic algorithm, Journal Chemistry International, 279-290.
- El Merbouh, B., Bourjila, M., Tijar, R., Drissi El Bouzaidi, R., El Gridani, A., El Mouhtadi, M., 2014.Conformational space analysis of neutral and protonated glycine using a genetic algorithm for multi-modal search. Journal of Theoretical and Computational Chemistry 13, 1450067.

- Giammar, D. E., Dzombak, D. A., 1998. Copper Complexation with the Mellitic Acid Series, Journal Solution Chemistry 27, 89-105.
- Holland, J. H., 1976. Adaptation in Natural and Artificial Systems. University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor.
- Opgrande, J. L., Dobratz, C. J., Brown, E. E., Liang, J. C., Conn, G. S., Wirth, J., Shelton, J., 1992. 4th ed., in: J.I. Kroschwitz, M. Howe-Grant (Eds.), Kirk-Othmer Encyclopedia of Chemical Technology, vol. 4, Wiley, New York, pp. 103–115.
- Read, D. E., Purves, C. B., 1952. Separation of Benzene Hexa-, Penta- and the Three Isomeric Tetracarboxylic Acids and their Methyl Esters. Journal of the American Chemical Society 74 (1), 116–119.
- Tijar, R., El Merbouh, B., Bourjila M., EL Guerdaoui, A., El Merbouh, B., Drissi El Bouzaidi, R., El Gridani, A., EL Mouhtadi, M., 2016. Conformational space analysis of neutral and deprotonated forms of benzoic acid, salicylic acid and phthalic acid using a genetic algorithm, Journal Chemistry International 2(4), 184-205.
- Zoran, M., Dalibor, B., and Ivan, G., 2004. Geometry and conformations of benzenecarboxylic acids, JJournal of the Serbian Chemical Society 69 (11).877–882.

Visit us at: http://bosaljournals.com/chemint/ Submissions are accepted at: editorci@bosaljournals.com